



Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee

Date: Tuesday, 22 June 2021

Time: 10.00 am

Venue: Council Chamber, Level 2, Town Hall Extension

This is a **Supplementary Agenda** containing additional information about the business of the meeting that was not available when the agenda was published

Access to the Public Gallery

Access to the Public Gallery is on Level 3 of the Town Hall Extension, using the lift or stairs in the lobby of the Mount Street entrance to the Extension. **There is no public access from any other entrance.**

Filming and broadcast of the meeting

Meetings of the Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee are 'webcast'. These meetings are filmed and broadcast live on the Internet. If you attend this meeting you should be aware that you might be filmed and included in that transmission.

Membership of the Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee

Councillors - Hacking (Chair), Azra Ali, Shaukat Ali, Andrews, Battle, Chambers, Connolly, M Dar, Douglas, Evans, Grimshaw, Hilal, S Judge, Rawson, Sheikh, Whiston, Wills and Wilson

Supplementary Agenda

5. **Peterloo Memorial** 3 - 10
Report of the Director of City Centre Growth and Infrastructure

This report provides an update on the decision taken in respect of the Peterloo Memorial following the public meeting on 3 March 2021, and the comments received during and after the meeting.

Further Information

For help, advice and information about this meeting please contact the Committee Officer:

Rachel McKeon
Tel: 0161 234 4497
Email: rachel.mckeon@manchester.gov.uk

This supplementary agenda was issued on **Thursday, 17 June 2021** by the Governance and Scrutiny Support Unit, Manchester City Council, Level 3, Town Hall Extension (Lloyd Street Elevation), Manchester M60 2LA

**Manchester City Council
Report for Information**

Report to: Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee - 22 June 2021

Subject: Peterloo Memorial

Report of: Director of City Centre Growth and Infrastructure

Summary

This report provides an update on the decision taken in respect of the Peterloo Memorial following the public meeting on 3^r March 2021, and the comments received during and after the meeting.

Recommendations

1. Members are asked to note the approach taken to ensure design development consultations are undertaken with the wider access community, to provide greater inclusivity. This has been undertaken with both the Medieval Quarter and Glade of Light Access Group and the City Centre Transport Access Group as examples of recent initiatives.
 2. Note the decision taken by the City Council as set out in Section 3 of the report.
-

Wards Affected: Deansgate

Environmental Impact Assessment - the impact of the issues addressed in this report on achieving the zero-carbon target for the City

The construction of the Peterloo Memorial was undertaken in the context of Manchester achieving its zero-carbon target for the city. The location of the Memorial is easily accessible using sustainable modes of transport.
--

Our Manchester Strategy outcomes	Summary of how this report aligns to the OMS
<p>A thriving and sustainable city: supporting a diverse and distinctive economy that creates jobs and opportunities</p>	<p>2019 marked a once-in-a-generation opportunity to remember and raise the profile of the Peterloo Massacre. This important historic event for the city was commemorated through the completion of the Memorial and a coordinated programme of events over the summer, including the performance event on the 16th August 2019, to mark the 200th anniversary for the Peterloo Massacre. The Memorial is a key visitor destination, depicting the location's historical story. The Memorial provides an important visitor attraction, and remembrance place, where anniversary and other events can be held, adding to the attractiveness of the city centre as a visitor destination. This can help support the ongoing growth of the city centre. In addition, the Memorial is located close to Manchester Central, adding a point of interest for visitors to events held at the venue.</p>
<p>A highly skilled city: world class and home grown talent sustaining the city's economic success</p>	<p>The delivery of the Memorial in the heart of the city centre has added to the visual attractiveness of its location. There will be an ongoing opportunity for local school children and residents to learn from the historic events and participate in future events.</p>
<p>A progressive and equitable city: making a positive contribution by unlocking the potential of our communities</p>	<p>The Peterloo Memorial marks the gathering of 60,000 Greater Manchester residents in peaceful protest 200 years ago. It provides a focal point for local residents and visitors to be informed of the event close by the site of the original St Peter's Field. The lessons learned from the design and engagement stages of the Peterloo Memorial project, will be used to strengthen our mechanisms for consulting with disabled people in the city and with disabled people's organisations through taking an Our Manchester approach.</p>

<p>A liveable and low carbon city: a destination of choice to live, visit, work</p>	<p>In addition to adding to the attractiveness of the city centre, the Memorial is in a location that is easily accessible by public transport. For the 60,000 city centre residents and 140,000 people working within the city centre, the Memorial will be within walking distance. For those living in the wider Manchester and Greater Manchester region and visitors nationally, the Peterloo Memorial will be easily accessible using sustainable modes of transport. The St. Peter's Square and Deansgate-Castlefield Metrolink stops are within a few minutes' walk, as is Deansgate and Oxford Road Railway Stations. In addition, the location of the Memorial is close to key bus routes that serve the city including the free Metroshuttle service.</p>
<p>A connected city: world class infrastructure and connectivity to drive growth</p>	<p>The Civic Quarter benefits from excellent transport connectivity. This includes strong public transport links, as outlined above, with both rail and Metrolink stations within a two-minute walk from the location identified for the Peterloo Memorial. This will reduce the need for car trips to the site, supporting the city's strategy of creating world class sustainable transport infrastructure.</p>

Contact Officers:

Name: Pat Bartoli
 Position: Director of City Centre Growth and Infrastructure
 Telephone: 0161 234 3329
 E-mail: pat.bartoli@manchester.gov.uk

Name: Dave Carty
 Position: Development Manager
 Telephone: 0161 234 5908
 E-mail: dave.carty@manchester.gov.uk

Background documents (available for public inspection):

The following documents disclose important facts on which the report is based and have been relied upon in preparing the report. Copies of the background documents are available up to 4 years after the date of the meeting. If you would like a copy, please contact one of the contact officers above.

Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee – 20 June 2019

Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee – 5 September 2019

Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee – 5 November 2020

The Peterloo Memorial Campaign Group Brief produced in 2016

Peterloo Memorial Adaption Options prepared by Caruso St. John Architects 22 October 2019

Minutes of the Adaption of the Peterloo Memorial Meeting 22 October 2019

New Ramp Proposal prepared by the Access Campaign Group 11 February 2020

Transcript of the Public Meeting held on the 3rd March 2020

1.0 Introduction

- 1.1. The Peterloo Memorial is a public art installation telling the story of the Massacre with information of who died and where they had travelled from. The Memorial was completed and handed over to the City Council on Tuesday 13 August 2019 prior to the 200th anniversary of the massacre on the 16th August 2019.
- 1.2. A report to the 5 September Scrutiny Committee 2019 provided an update on the implementation of the Peterloo Memorial, and progress on the work undertaken to review the options for the adaption of the completed structure to ensure it is fully accessible. The report explored six options which had been developed by the architects Caruso St. John and the artist Jeremy Deller in discussion with officers and representatives of both the Peterloo Massacre Campaign Group and the Peterloo Massacre Accessibility Campaign Group at meetings held on the 19 July 2019 and the 14 August 2019.
- 1.3. The architects Caruso St. John produced a detailed report for a meeting held with the representatives of both the Peterloo Massacre Campaign group and the Peterloo Massacre Accessibility Campaign group on the 22 October 2019 looking at six options. The report and the minutes of the meeting have previously been circulated to the Committee Members. The Peterloo Massacre Accessibility Campaign Group produced a further south ramp option in February 2020 which has also been circulated to the Committee Members. A verbal report by the Director of City Centre Growth and Infrastructure to the Scrutiny Committee on the 3 September 2020 highlighted that none of the options had proved viable including the new south ramp option. This was due to the constraints of the site and the geometry of the Memorial.
- 1.4. The Scrutiny Committee received a further update report on the 5th November 2020, which noted that a public meeting was proposed to take place to receive a detailed report of the options considered to make the Peterloo Memorial accessible. The public meeting took place on 3 March 2021, to ensure plenty of time was given to enable as greater access and attendance as possible.

2.0 Background

- 2.1. The City Council has acknowledged that mistakes were made in developing the Memorial and that insufficient consideration was given to access issues as thinking around the design evolved. The City Council also acknowledges that it is a matter of regret that despite working together over almost two years we have been unable to come up with a tenable solution to make the Memorial fully accessible. Important lessons have been learnt and considerations about accessibility have been at the forefront of the subsequent design and consultation processes for, as an example, the Glade of Light Memorial to the victims of the Manchester Arena terrorist attack. An Access Working Group was established to provide input into the concept design and development prior to the scheme being submitted for planning approval. A Transport Access Working Group has also been established to consult on future transport schemes. In an important development, members of the access

community participating in meetings are paid for their time and together these new inclusive design consultation processes will be rolled out by the Council for future transport, monuments/public art and public realm projects.

- 2.2. The Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Team has worked closely with the City Centre Growth and Infrastructure Team in convening members of the access community to assist the City Council in developing new approaches to inclusive design consultation, involving engagement and advice at all stages of the design, procurement and build stages of new projects. The Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Team are also looking at developing inclusive design training for City Council project officers. Furthermore, the Team is considering how the City Council can best review and update inclusive design policy advice to project officers. These new inclusive design consultation processes with project officers working with design teams and contractors and involving a wide cross section of accessibility groups, organisations and individuals is already delivering results with the Glade of Light now under construction in the Medieval Quarter.
- 2.3. The six options to remodel the Memorial developed by the architects involved various ramp or lift designs. The nature of the design of the Memorial is such that five of the ramp designs would either have an overbearing impact on the monument, obscuring the details of the people who died and where they were coming from, as well as overshadowing its appearance. The north ramp option would severely impact upon the forecourt area of Manchester Central as it would require the use of a significant amount of extra land owned by Manchester Central Convention Complex and used during major events there. When the Conference and Events Centre reopens this forecourt area will be rented out to exhibitors to promote events taking place in the main hall, and any ramp in this location will impact on access to and from the Centre. The sixth platform lift option posed a range of technical and maintenance difficulties. The additional south ramp design proposed by the Accessibility Campaign Group posed the same issues of having an overbearing impact on the Memorial and lack of space. The detailed work undertaken by the architects clearly demonstrates there is insufficient space to the south, east and west to introduce a ramp feature.
- 2.4. The public meeting on the 3 March was attended by 44 members of the public. The design team presented all the potential ramp remodel options they have developed and commented on the difficulties presented by the new south ramp option developed by the Peterloo Massacre Accessibility Campaign Group. The option of a temporary ramp solution was discussed but not supported by the Accessibility Campaign Group representatives. The recording of this meeting and the transcript have previously been circulated to Members and other people requesting copies.
- 2.5. Members have requested information on how comments submitted by people who were unable to attend the public meeting have been dealt with. The City Council stated at the public meeting that anyone not able to attend could submit their comments by close of play on 8 March 2021.

- 2.6. There was a total of 33 emails received following the Peterloo Memorial public meeting, with 27 emails commenting on the potential adaptations. They were received from both attendees of the public meeting and others who had viewed the webcast after the meeting.
- 2.7. Most respondents felt that the public consultation during the design phase was insufficient. Therefore, in future, there will be specific targeted consultation with the disabled community, as outlined above. There were also comments on the arrangements for the public meeting itself, which some individuals felt was rushed and was not widely publicised. Among those who responded, the majority stated that a fully accessible memorial would be the only acceptable solution.
- 2.8. The delay from holding a public meeting in November 2020 to March 2021 was caused by the need by officers to explore how best to manage a fully accessible public meeting. A specialist company MyClear Text was engaged to provide the live captioning and BSL interpreters throughout the meeting and both live recordings and transcripts were provided. The Accessibility Campaign Group representatives were notified of the date of the public meeting on the 10 February.

3.0 Conclusions

- 3.1. The Memorial represents a very important historic commemorative commission of public art for the city. Whilst clearly there are elements of the art installation that people can interact with by climbing the steps, it's undoubtedly possible to be appreciated and engaged with without having to ascend it. Six options were developed by the architects involving various ramp or lift designs, but none have proved feasible. Five of the ramp designs would either have an overbearing impact on the monument, obscuring the details of the people who died as well as overshadowing its appearance, or required the use of a significant amount of extra land owned by Manchester Central Convention Complex and used during major events there. The other, the platform lift option, posed a range of technical and maintenance difficulties. An additional south ramp design was proposed by the Accessibility Campaign Group with the same issues of having an overbearing impact on the Memorial and lack of space. Despite the best endeavours of everyone involved since the summer of 2019, it has not proved possible to find an acceptable permanent solution. There is simply insufficient space, given its location to find a workable solution without seriously impairing the existing art installation. Therefore, the City Council has now taken the decision that no alterations will be made to the existing memorial design. While the time and effort spent on finding an accessible design solution for the Peterloo Memorial has not produced the result everyone wanted, this work has not been in vain because there is a positive, inclusive legacy with new inclusive design consultation processes being developed.

4.0 Recommendations

- 4.1. Recommendations can be found at the front of the report.

This page is intentionally left blank